

How to identify experts in a community?

Balázs Sziklai

HAS

Abstract

There is a set of individuals $N = \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ and we would like to know if some of them belong to a certain group or not. We may inquire the opinion of the individuals on this matter, which they state via an n -dimensional vector containing only zeros and ones. Kasher and Rubinstein axiomatized the self-identification rule which assigns a person to the group if and only if the person thinks that he belongs to the group. This rule indeed resolves the problem when the group characteristics depend on the inner beliefs of the individuals, e.g. nationality, religiousness. However it does not fare so well when there seems to be an 'objective' criteria that determines who belongs to the group. For instance if we ask "Who is a celebrity?" then self-identification may not be the best solution - although it seems that some people do believe so. Another - and probably more important - question would be "Who is an expert?". Again this is a question for which we can not depend exclusively upon the self-opinion of people".